

Wednesday 30 September, 2020

Rt Hon Jacinda Ardern

Prime Minister

Parliament Buildings

Wellington 6160

By email: j.ardern@ministers.govt.nz

Cc: Hon Chris Hipkins

Minister of Health

By email: c.hipkins@ministers.govt.nz

Dear Prime Minister,

I am writing to inform you of deeply flawed decision-making and gross obfuscation on the part of your drug-buying agency, Pharmac.

I understand that the Government prefers not to intervene in Pharmac’s processes and decisions on grounds of maintaining its ‘independence’, but you need to be aware that this taxpayer-funded government agency is failing in its core functions, and urgently needs to be independently investigated and held to account.

I am writing to you because there is no other avenue to achieve justice for our patients on this matter, and all of our attempts over several weeks to engage with your Minister of Health have been declined. To ensure this issue is properly drawn to the attention of the public, we are sharing this letter with the media.

Recently Pharmac arrived at a decision not to fund any further drugs for the treatment of severe inflammatory bowel disease (IBD) in patients who have failed every other funded treatment. They regard it as not cost effective. The drugs we urgently need are mainstream treatments funded throughout the Western world – in 37 countries – but not in NZ. There are currently five additional drugs funded to treat IBD in other countries. There have been no new drugs funded for IBD in NZ since 2011. The options for NZ patients in this situation are multiple hospitalisations, usually through the emergency department, and irreversible surgeries to remove sections of the bowel, often culminating in permanent stoma bags. Consigning people (most of whom are children and young adults) to lives with severe pain, disfiguring surgery and social isolation is unnecessary and a heavy cost to the health system.

Dr Malcolm Arnold (President of the New Zealand Society of Gastroenterology) and I met recently with Pharmac Deputy Medical Director Dr Peter Murray and other senior Pharmac executives to attempt to understand this inexplicable and inhumane decision. We were astounded by Pharmac’s lack of knowledge on current direct health costs for IBD patents failing conventional treatments, and to learn that Pharmac does not actually have the data on the most important current treatment costs. Incredibly, they asked us if we could provide the data to them!

Despite a lengthy follow-up description from Pharmac’s Medical Director, Dr Ken Clark, of the organisation’s cost-utility assessment methodology and its processes, it has become clear to me that the Pharmac model is deeply flawed. No matter what the processes are, if the data Pharmac puts into its models is incorrect with false assumptions, then the results of such models will also be flawed.

Even without counting the indirect health costs of ruined lives and lost productivity, we know that the treatments we are asking for are affordable when weighed against the current health system costs, including futile double dosing of current funded treatments (eg infliximab). How is it that the rest of the Western world saw fit to fund these treatments, but Pharmac does not? Does it mean New Zealanders are worth less?

For many years I had read and believed the Pharmac-generated spin about the great job it does using data and tough negotiations to improve access to drugs for New Zealanders. However, having interacted with Pharmac staff over this specific issue, I feel embarrassed that I accepted Pharmac decisions in the past. The suggestion that we need to generate data for Pharmac to do its job, is simply bizarre. Surely it is Pharmac’s role to know how and where drugs are being prescribed in New Zealand? Surely it is Pharmac’s responsibility to ensure that the right data is entered into their models to ensure that the right decisions on drug access are made for New Zealanders?

In searching Pharmac’s website for insight into its processes, I discovered its six strategic priorities:

* enhance key functions
* medical devices
* equitable access and use
* data and analytics
* public understanding, trust and confidence
* relationships and partnerships.

In our interactions with Pharmac on this issue, it is clear these do not apply. Pharmac has **failed to enhance its key functions**, it **denies equitable access to IBD patients** (whilst those with similar inflammatory diseases have multiple funded treatment options), it **asks others to generate the data that it needs and uses incorrect assumptions** (even though it should have these data), it **has lost the trust and confidence of the public** (30,000 signatories to a petition at present [www.wecantwait.nz](http://www.wecantwait.nz)) and has **failed to engage in meaningful relationships through a lack of transparency** in its dealings.

Dr Clark concluded his email to me by stating “…we believe we are all looking for the same end result –  better outcomes for people with IBD.” The actions of Pharmac to date on this issue demonstrate that this is patently untrue. If Pharmac was genuinely looking for “better outcomes for people with IBD” it would acknowledge these realities and proceed actively and urgently with the processes required to fund this medicine.

I am happy to provide you with a full record of my exchange with Pharmac, and my colleagues and I are more than willing to meet with you if that would achieve meaningful progress on this matter. My views are strongly shared by the membership of the NZ Society of Gastroenterology, the NZ IBD Nurses Group, Crohn’s & Colitis NZ, and 20,000 IBD patients and their families throughout NZ. Listed below are the names of 105 colleagues/specialists who personally endorse this letter.

We are not asking you to make an exception with this case. We are asking you to investigate this indefensible decision urgently and ensure that a fair, transparent and rapid process is pursued to provide justice, fairness and compassion to New Zealanders suffering unnecessarily with this terrible disease.

Regards,

 

**Dr Richard Gearry, MB ChB, PhD, FRACP**

Professor of Medicine, University of Otago, Christchurch

Consultant Gastroenterologist, Canterbury District Health Board

Chair, International Organisation for the study of IBD Globalization Cluster

Faculty, World Gastroenterology Organisation IBD Guidelines Group

richard.gearry@otago.ac.nz

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Dr Sarah Abbott Colorectal Surgeon Canterbury DHB | Dr Malcolm Arnold**President, NZ Society of Gastroenterology** GastroenterologistCanterbury DHB | Dr Nathan AtkinsonGastroenterologist Waitemata DHB |
| Dr Wayne BaiGastroenterologist Waikato DHB | Professor Murray Barclay Gastroenterologist Canterbury DHB | Dr Juneid Beig Gastroenterology Advanced TraineeWaikato DHB |
| Dr Rachel BergmanGastroenterologist Auckland DHB | Dr Jonathan Bishop Paediatric GastroenterologistStarshipAuckland DHB | Dr James BrookerGastroenterologist Waikato DHB |
| Dr Stephen Burmeister Gastroenterologist Waitemata DHB | Dr Michael Burt Gastroenterologist Canterbury DHB | Dr Rees CameronGastroenterologist Capital & Coast DHB |
| Dr Paul Casey Gastroenterologist Counties Manukau DHB | Dr Chris CederwallGastroenterologist Capital & Coast DHB | Dr Teresa Chalmers-Watson Gastroenterologist Canterbury DHB |
| Dr Hui Chan Gastroenterologist Bay of Plenty DHB | Dr Simon ChinPaediatric GastroenterologistStarshipAuckland DHB | Dr Adrian Claydon**Chair, NZ Advanced Training Subcommittee**Gastroenterologist Bay of Plenty DHB |
| Sarah Cook, RNClinical Nurse Specialist IBDWaikato DHB | Dr Rob Cunliffe Gastroenterologist Bay of Plenty DHB | Dr Charlotte Daker Gastroenterologist Waitemata DHB |
| Professor Andrew Day**Chair and Professor of Paediatric Research**Paediatric GastroenterologistCanterbury DHB | Dr Dara De Las HerasGastroenterologist Waikato DHB | Dr Graeme DicksonGastroenterologist Waikato DHB |
| Dr Steven Ding Gastroenterologist Canterbury DHB | Dr James Falvey Gastroenterologist Canterbury DHB | Dr Paul FrankishGastroenterologist Waitemata DHB |
| Dr Rowan French **President, NZ Association of General Surgeons** Waikato DHB | Dr John Frye Colorectal Surgeon Canterbury DHB | Dr James FulforthGastroenterologist Waikato DHB |
| Dr James FulforthGastroenterologist Waikato DHB | Dr Stephen Gerred Gastroenterologist Counties Manukau DHB | Dr Tamara Glyn Colorectal Surgeon Canterbury DHB |
| Dr Ben GriffithsGastroenterologist Capital & Coast DHB | Lisa Griffiths, RNClinical Nurse Specialist IBDCapital & Coast DHB | Dr Melissa HainesGastroenterologist Waikato DHB |
| Dr Kyle Hendry Gastroenterologist Southern DHB | Dr Judy Huang Gastroenterologist Counties Manukau DHB | Dr Stephen Inns Gastroenterologist Hutt Valley DHB |
| Dr Estella JohnsGastroenterologist Capital & Coast DHB | Dr Sean Kelly Gastroenterologist Bay of Plenty DHB | Dr Clarence KerrisonGastroenterology Advanced TraineeCounties Manukau DHB |
| Dr Afrasyab Khan Gastroenterology Fellow Counties Manukau DHB | Dr Bong-Suk Ko Gastroenterologist Waikato DHB | Dr Jan Kubovy Gastroenterologist Canterbury DHB |
| Dr Dinesh Lal Gastroenterologist Counties Manukau DHB | Dr Alex Lampen-SmithGastroenterologist Bay of Plenty DHB | Associate Professor Mark Lane**Past President, Royal Australasian College of Physicians****Past President, NZ Society of Gastroenterology** GastroenterologistAuckland DHB |
| Dr Marianne Lill Colorectal SurgeonWhanganui DHB | Dr Gary LimGastroenterologist Canterbury DHB | Dr Ming Han LimGastroenterologist Counties Manukau DHB |
| Dr Tien Huey LimGastroenterologist Counties Manukau DHB | Dr Derek Luo Gastroenterologist Counties Manukau DHB | Dr Jasen Ly General Surgeon Waikato DHB |
| Dr Kirsty Macfarlane Gastroenterology Advanced Trainee  | Dr Paul ManuelGeneral Surgeon Southland DHB | Dr David McGouran Gastroenterologist Bay of Plenty DHB |
| Dr Adele Melton Gastroenterologist Counties Manukau DHB | Lucy Mills, RNClinical Nurse Specialist Counties Manukau DHB | Dr Stephen MouatPaediatric HepatologistGastroenterologist StarshipAuckland DHB |
| Dr Thomas MulesGastroenterology Advanced Trainee | Dr Helen Myint Gastroenterologist Auckland DHB | Dr Itty Mathew Nadakkavukaran Gastroenterologist Waitemata DHB |
| Dr Jeffrey Ngu Gastroenterologist Canterbury DHB | Marian O'Connor, RN**Co-Chair, NZ IBD Nurses Group**Clinical Nurse Specialist Taranaki DHB | Dr Paddy O'Connor Gastroenterologist Southern DHB |
| Dr Ravinder Ogra Gastroenterologist Counties Manukau DHB | Dr John Perry Gastroenterologist Waitemata DHB | Dr Ashok RajGastroenterologist Counties Manukau DHB |
| Dr Zoe Raos**President Elect, NZ Society of Gastroenterology**Gastroenterologist Waitemata DHB | Dr Sarah RennieGeneral Surgeon**Clinical Skills Director**University of Otago  | Harun Riza, RNGastroenterology Charge Nurse Manager (CNM) Counties Manukau DHB |
| Dr Amin Roberts Paediatric GastroenterologistStarshipAuckland DHB | Dr Nicola Robson Gastroenterology Fellow StarshipAuckland DHB | Kirsten Rosser, RNClinical Nurse Specialist IBDCanterbury DHB |
| Dr Charlotte RowanGastroenterologist Waitemata DHB | Dr David Rowbotham Gastroenterologist Auckland DHB | Dr Clare RussellGastroenterologist Waitemata DHB |
| Dr Paul SamsonGeneral Surgeon Southland DHB | Dr Kurt SanfordGastroenterologist Canterbury DHB | Dr Cameron SchauerGastroenterologist Fellow Waitemata DHB |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Professor Michael Schultz **Professor of Medicine****University of Otago****Past President, NZ Society of Gastroenterology** Gastroenterologist Southern DHB | Dr Anurag SekraGastroenterologistCounties Manukau DHB | Dr Sam Seleq Gastroenterology Advanced Trainee Waikato DHB |
| Dr Sriharan SelvaratnamGastroenterologist Counties Manukau DHB | Dr Ahsan Siddiqui Gastroenterologist Canterbury DHB | Dr Nick Smith General Surgeon Waikato DHB  |
| Associate Professor Catherine Stedman**Clinical Associate Professor****University of Otago** Canterbury DHB | Dr Richard Stein**Chair, Crohn's & Colitis New Zealand Charitable Trust**GastroenterologistNorthland & Hawkes Bay DHB | Jacqui Stone, NP**Chair, NZ IBD Nurses Group**Nurse PractitionerCounties Manukau DHB |
| Dr Heidi Su Gastroenterologist Canterbury DHB | Dr Arjun SugumaranGastroenterologist Northland DHB | Dr Akhilesh SwaminathanAdvanced Trainee in GastroenterologyCanterbury DHB |
| Dr Vivek Tharayil Gastroenterologist Waikato DHB | Dr Jimmy Tiong Advanced Trainee in GastroenterologyCanterbury DHB | Dr Marius Van Rijnsoever Gastroenterologist Waitemata DHB |
| Dr Sunny Veerappan Gastroenterologist Bay of Plenty DHB | Dr Christopher WakemanColorectal Surgeon Canterbury DHB | Dr Russell Walmsley **Chair, Endoscopy Guidance Group for New Zealand****Past President, NZ Society of Gastroenterology**GastroenterologistWaitemata DHB |
| Dr Henry WeiGastroenterologist Counties Manukau DHB | Dr Frank Weilert**Clinical Director, Gastroenterology**GastroenterologistWaikato DHB | Dr Ian Wilson Gastroenterologist Capital & Coast DHB |
| Dr Philip Wong Gastroenterologist Auckland DHB | Dr Linus WuGeneral Surgeon Waikato DHB | Dr John Wyeth **Former Medical Director, Pharmac****Past President, NZ Society of Gastroenterology**GastroenterologistCapital & Coast DHB  |